### **ORIGINAL**

# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA OL FER - Q

	-	P Official	11.007		)	,	V	3
]4	FEB	-	9	PM	<b> :</b>	2	1	)

9.5. bis i	HILL COURT	7
N.D. OF	ALABAMA	•

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,	)
<b>v.</b>	) ) CR-03-BE-0530-S
RICHARD M. SCRUSHY,	)
Defendant.	
	<u>'</u>

## RICHARD M. SCRUSHY'S OPPOSITION TO GOVERNMENT'S MOTION TO MODIFY DISCOVERY ORDER

Defendant Richard M. Scrushy, through his undersigned counsel, hereby respectfully objects to the government's Motion to Modify Discovery Order.

- 1. Federal Rule of Criminal Procedure 16 governs pre-trial discovery in criminal cases, not the proceedings at trial.
- 2. The Jencks Act, 18 U.S.C. § 3500, as with other rules, exists parallel to Rule 16. The fact that a witness's prior statement (in this instance an expert witness) will be released as Jencks Act material, even if not under Rule 16, is not unusual. Jencks disclosures sometimes trump other rules when they conflict, such as where Brady material is contained within Jencks disclosures, the Brady material is produced when the Jencks disclosures are made. See United States v. Scott, 524 F.2d 465, 467 (5<sup>th</sup> Cir. 1975).
- 3. As the government states in its motion, the parties in this case consented to pretrial production. On December 30, 2003, this Court, in a well thought out scheduling Order, set out that *Jencks* disclosures are to be provided no later than three weeks preceding the trial for

was well-aware when agreeing to the pretrial production of *Jencks* disclosures that Defendant was under no obligation to seek discovery of expert witness reports under Rule 16(a)(1)(G).

- 4. In its motion, the government seeks to withhold expert witness statements until after the expert witness has testified at trial. To postpone the production of such statements until after the witnesses have testified will only serve to undercut the currently established process to keep the case progressing in a timely fashion. Defense counsel would need a continuance after each government expert witness had testified on direct examination in order to review the expert report, conduct background research on the expert and prepare cross-examination.
- 5. No harm inures to the government to produce *Jencks* material pursuant to the current time schedule. It is not as if defense counsel could contact the government's expert witnesses prior to trial in hopes of garnering some advantage.
- 6. Finally, the government is undergoing no greater discovery requirement than Defendant. Under the same scheduling order, defense counsel will provide expert reports as reverse *Jencks* no later than one week *prior* to trial even though there is no obligation to do so under Rule 16.

#### **CONCLUSION**

Some unavoidable issues will undoubtedly arise that will delay the progress of the trial, but the delay that would be caused by the government's suggestion is unwarranted. For the foregoing reasons, the government's Motion to Modify Discovery Order should be denied.

Dated: February 9, 2004

Respectfully submitted

Abbe David Lowell, Esq. Thomas V. Sjoblom, Esq. Chadbourne & Parke, LLP 1200 New Hampshire, Ave. NW Washington, D.C. 20036 (202) 974-5600

Arthur W. Leach, Esq.

c/o Thomas, Means, Gillis & Seay

H. Lewis Gillis

Raymond L. Johnson Jr. 1035 Financial Center

505 20<sup>th</sup> Street North

Birmingham, Alabama 35203

(205) 328-7915

Attorneys for Defendant Richard M. Scrushy

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on February 9, 2004, a copy of the foregoing Richard M. Scrushy's Opposition to Government's Motion to Modify Discovery Order was served by facsimile and overnight mail to:

Alice Martin, Esquire
United States Attorney for the
Northern District of Alabama
U.S. Department of Justice
1801 4th Avenue North
Birmingham, Alabama 35203

Richard C. Smith, Esquire
Deputy Chief
Fraud Section
U.S. Department of Justice
10th and Constitution Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20530

Julie A. Campbell

Chadbourne & Parke, LLP 1200 New Hampshire, Ave. NW

Washington, D.C. 20036

(202) 974-5600